folk/ed. 2021; 27(2) 106 Ek
DOI: 10.22559/folklor.1727

Araştırma makalesi/Research article

Woman Issues from the Perspective of Feminist Translation: Sylvia Plath and "Mothers"

Feminist Çeviri Bakış Açısıyla Kadın Sorunları: Sylvia Plath ve "Anneler"

Alize Can Rençberler*

Abstract

Sylvia Plath, who is known for her poems and proses in American Literature, has been being translated into Turkish literature and culture system for many years. Having contributed to Turkish literature, some of her works embody female characters who strive at gaining a place in society. Being a woman and a mother of two, Plath had difficulties in her life and had to stand out against psychological problems stemming from the death of her father and pressure from her husband. Taken all together, it is within the bounds of possibility that Plath's life redounded on her works and translated narrations. To illustrate and investigate this view, one of Plath's short stories, Mothers is analyzed and discourses which indicate woman issues (motherhood/womanhood, social belonging, sorority and patriarchy) are identified and compared to the Turkish translation to comprehend how they are produced in the target language by a woman translator.

In this respect, the translator is interviewed through e-mail and gives information on her translation process. Regarding the analysis of the translation, the Turkish

Geliş tarihi (Received): 01.03.2021 – Kabul tarihi (Accepted): 28.05.2021

* Dr. Öğr. Gör. Trakya Üniversitesi İngilizce Mütercim Tercümanlık. alizecan@gmail.com. ORCID 0000-0001-7187-6614.

target text is analyzed through the terms of initial norms, preliminary norms and operational norms posited by Gideon Toury. The first two are presented in the scope of adequacy/acceptability and translation policy/directness of translation. As for the operational norms, feminist translation scholar Luise von Flotow's (1991) categorization of translation strategies and other strategies by Vinay & Darbelnet (1995) and Delabastita (1993) are utilized to sort out the translator's strategies. At the end of the analysis, it is concluded that the translator mostly utilizes literal translation and transposition in line with equivalence and modulation. It is also noteworthy to mention that the translation of a word does not match with the strategies presented. Accordingly, as none of the translation strategies served the purpose, a new translation strategy coined obscuring, has been suggested.
Keywords: *feminist translation, Luise von Flotow, descriptive translation studies, Sylvia Plath*

Öz

Amerikan Edebiyatında şiirleri ve düzyazılarıyla tanınan Sylvia Plath, uzun yıllardır Türk edebiyatına ve kültür dizgesine aktarılmaktadır. Eserlerinde toplumda yer edinmeye çalışan kadın karakterlere yer veren Plath, kadın ve iki çocuk annesi olarak hayatında zorluklar yaşamış; babasının ölümü ve kocasının baskısından kaynaklanan psikolojik sorunlara karşı göğüs germek zorunda kalmıştır. Tüm bunlar göz önünde bulundurulduğunda, Plath'ın hayatının eserleri üzerinde etkisi olduğu muhtemeldir. Bu görüşü açıklamak ve incelemek amacıyla Plath'ın kısa öykülerinden Mothers incelenmiş, kadın sorunlarına (annelik, kadınlık, toplumsal aidiyet ve ataerkillik) işaret eden söylemler belirlenmiş ve bu söylemlerin Türkçede kadın çevirmen tarafından nasıl üretildiğini anlamak için Türkçe çevirisi kaynak metin ile karşılaştırılmıştır. Bu bağlamda çevirmen ile e-posta aracılığıyla görüşülmüş ve çeviri süreci ile ilgili bilgi edinilmiştir. Eser çevirisinin çözümlenmesiyle ilgili olarak, çeviride erek odaklı yaklaşımı benimseyen Gideon Toury tarafından öne sürülen öncül normlara, süreç öncesi normlara ve süreç normlarına başvurulmuştur. Bu normlardan ilk ikisi ile erek metin yeterlilik/kabul edilebilirlik ve çeviri politikası/çevirinin doğrudanlığı kapsamında ele alınmış; süreç normları aracılığıyla ise çevirmenin çeviri stratejilerini açığa çıkarmak için feminist çeviri araştırmacısı Luise von Flotow (1991)'un önerdiği çeviri stratejilerinden yararlanılmış; Vinay & Darbelnet (1995) ve Delabastita (1993) tarafından ortaya konan diğer çeviri stratejilerine de başvurulmuştur. Çalışma kapsamında yapılan çözümlemelerden hareketle, çevirmenin çoğunlukla sözcüğü sözcüğüne ve biçim değiştirme çeviri stratejilerine başvurduğu; bunun yanı sıra eşdeğerlik ve odak değiştirme1 stratejilerini de kullandığı anlaşılmıştır. Anlatıda geçen bir sözcüğün çevirisi ile ilgili olarak, sunulan feminist çeviri stratejilerinden hiçbirinin uymadığı sonucuna varılmış ve belirsizleştirme ismiyle yeni bir feminist çeviri stratejisi önerisinde bulunulmuştur.
Anahtar sözcükler: *feminist çeviri, Luise von Flotow, betimleyici çeviri araştırmaları, Sylvia Plath*

Introduction

Emerging as the translation act of patriarchal and misogynist language use, the feminist translation movement was initiated by a group of feminist writers and translators in Quebec in the late 1970s and early 1980s and it was thought to be the articulation of feminist ideology to translation. Sherry Simon, Barbara Godard and Luise von Flotow, Olga Castro and Emek Ergun are among the leading names in this group defining and explaining feminist translation theory and practice.

To begin with, Simon (1996: 1) sets forth that "feminist translation theory aims to identify and critique the tangle of concepts which relegates both women and translation to the bottom of the social and literary ladder." She suggests that the processes in which the translation are feminized should be examined to maintain this aim. Concerning this view, Bozkurt (2014: 108) states that "feminist translation is against the twofold inferiority of women and translation. To erase this false equivalence, one should forget about the traditional views on translation theory and practice". In her book, Simon (1996: 2) discusses the role of the translation for women and indicates that translation was not only the means for accessing the universe of letters for women but also "a permissible form of public expression" and a crucial part of social movements such as slavery and first-wave feminism (Simon, 1996: 2).Another prominent figure in feminist translation studies, Barbara Godard (1989: 43), expresses that feminist theory and the translation of women writers deal with questions of language, gender, and women's troubling relationship with language.Irigaray, as cited in Godard, notes that "feminist discourse works upon language, upon the dominant discourse, in a radical interrogation of meaning and translation, in this theory of feminist discourse, is production, not reproduction" (Irigaray, as cited in Godard, 1989: 46). According to Godard, the scope of feminist translation theory is "feminist discourse in its transtextual or hypertextual relations, as palimpsest working on problematic notions of identity, dependency and equivalence" (1989: 47).

In her work, she concludes that "womanhandling the text in translation would involve the replacement of the modest, self-effacing translator. […] The feminist translator immodestly flaunts her signature in italics, in footnotes - even in a preface" and participates in the creation of meaning (1989: 50).

Olga Castro and Emek Ergun have argued, "the future of feminisms is in the transnational and the transnational is made through translation" (2017: 1). Parallel to this view, Castro, Ergun, von Flotow and Spoturno (2020: 7) stress that "a plural, intersectional and transnational conception of feminisms requires, no doubt, a critical articulation of translation", of which the understanding should cover not only "trans-linguistic/cultural/medial practices including the field of interpreting studies, intersemiotic translation, the translation of sign languages, and machine translation" but also "the travelling of theories and traditions" (2020: 2). Castro and Ergun (2017: 93) emphasize that feminist translation studies is an interdisciplinary field that deals with both feminism and translation, and it brings about the emergence of courses at

undergraduate and postgraduate levels across the world especially within translation studies programs and departments.

Academically, there is a rising interest in feminist translation studies in Turkey in recent years. The writings of Ergun (2017, 2013, 2010a, 2010b, 2008), Bozkurt (2014), Öner (2018), Saki and Tarakçıoğlu (2019), Kuleli (2019) are some of the significant and newsworthy works propounded in feminist translation studies.

In this part of the study, overall thoughts and views of these figures, except von Flotow have been presented. Her approach is included in the subheading 'Theoretical Framework' as it constitutes one of the pillars of methodology explaining feminist perspective to translation regarding the translation strategies *supplementing*, *prefacing – footnoting* and *hijacking*. Additionally, feminist translation strategies refined by Kim Wallmach (2006) including Jean-Paul Vinay and Jean Darbelnet's (1995) and Dirk Delabastita's strategies are presented to develop an analytical framework for the analysis. These strategies are integrated into the target-oriented approach suggested by Gideon Toury to illustrate the decisions taken by the translator referring to translation norms. As for the 'Methodology', the purpose of the research, research questions, research method, data collection and analysis are designated. In 'Findings', upon giving information about the author, the source text, the translator and the target text; a comparative analysis of source text and target text is carried out through the approaches of Toury and von Flotow. In conclusion, it is figured out that the translator mostly prefers using *transposition* in line with the strategies of *equivalence* and *modulation*.

1. Theoretical framework

1.1. Descriptive translation studies and target-oriented approach

Modern translation theories, which considers translation within the context of the target culture, include skopos theory, polysystem theory and Descriptive Translation Studies adopt a descriptive and target-oriented approach focusing on the role of translation in cultural history. Emerged in the early 1970s, it gathered speed in the 1980s and reached its peak in the 1990s.

Gideon Toury develops the target-oriented approach which has two important concepts: *adequacy* and *acceptability*. If the translation is close to the norms of the source text, it is considered as an *adequate translation*; if it is close to the norms of the target text, it is, then, accepted as an *acceptable translation* (Toury, 1995: 57). Toury (1995: 36-39 and 102) propounds a three-phase methodology for descriptive translation studies:

1. Situate the text within the target culture system, looking at its significance or acceptability.

2. Compare the ST and the TT for shifts, identifying relationships between coupled pairs' of ST and TT segments.

3. Attempt generalizations, reconstructing the process of translation for this ST-TT pair (as cited in Munday, 2008:110-111).

The most important feature of this theory, which emphasizes the need to make conscious decisions, is that it is goal-oriented and comprises norms that restrict the translator in the translation process (premise norms, pre-translation norms and translation process norms). According to Toury (1995: 56-59), three kinds of norms operate at the stages of the translation process: *initial norms*, *preliminary norms* and *operational norms*.

1. *Initial norms*: Translation decisions play a major role in determining the translator's initial norms. "The translator is called upon to make an overall choice between two extreme orientations" (Toury, 1995: 57): leaning on the source system norms (adequacy) or being close to the target system norms (acceptable).

2. *Preliminary norms*: Within the scope of preliminary norms, which include the decisions taken by the translator before starting the translation, there are "translation policy" and "directness of translation" (Toury, 1995: 58).

2.1. Translation policy: It "refers to those factors that govern the choice of text-types, even of individual texts, to be imported into a particular culture/language via translation at a particular point in time." (Toury, 1995: 58).

2.2. Directness of translation: It "involves the threshold of tolerance for translating from languages other than the ultimate SLs." (Toury, 1995: 58). This norm is related to whether the translation will be direct or indirect and which languages are involved in the translation practice.

3. *Operational norms*: It describes the linguistic matter of the translated text. Within the operational norms, there are matrical norms and textual-linguistic norms (Toury, 1995: 58).

2.1. Matrical norms: It is related to the fullness of the target text. It includes omission, addition or relocation of passages and footnotes and textual segmentation (Toury, 1995: 59).

Textual-linguistic norms: It is the selection of linguistic material such as lexical items, phrases and stylistic features. In this step, translation strategies suggested by Vinay & Darbelnet (1995), Delabastita (1993) and von Flotow are integrated to analyze the target text.

1.2. Feminist translation strategies

von Flotow (1997: 14) remarks that "the work of translating in an 'era of feminism', in an era powerfully influenced by feminist thought, has had an acute effect on translation practice". According to her (1997, 76), as the women are deliberately excluded from public spheres, "they have thus turned to translation as a 'humble' option".

In addition to theoretical thoughts, von Flotow (1991: 75-80) suggests strategies used in feminist translation: *supplementing*, *prefacing and footnoting*, and lastly *hijacking*. *Supplementing* "in feminist translation is a strategy (…) which compensates for the differences between languages, or constitutes 'voluntarist action' on the text" (von Flotow, 1991: 75). Feminist translators use *prefacing and footnoting* strategies when they want to emphasize their presence. The last strategy von Flotow (1991: 78-80) mentions is *hijacking* in which the translator feminizes the text deliberately to make the translator visible in the translation through excessive interference.

Additively, in her study titled "*Feminist translation strategies: Different or derived?"*, Kim Wallmach (2006) develops an analytical framework for the analysis of feminist translation strategies by refining Jean-Paul Vinay and Jean Darbelnet's (1995) and Dirk Delabastita's (1993) categories. Vinay and Darbelnet (1995: 31) conducted a comparative analysis of English and French and identified two general translation strategies: *direct translation* and *oblique translation*. While *direct translation* covers *borrowing, calque* and *literal translation, oblique translatio*n consists of *transposition, modulation, equivalence* and *adaptation* (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 31-40). These strategies operate on the lexical, syntactic and semantic levels in a text.

Borrowing is the strategy in which the translator prefers transferring the SL word directly from the target language to create a cultural flavor (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 31-32). The strategy of *calque* is used when the translator borrows an expression form of a language and translates each of its elements. There are two types of calque: *lexical calque*, which respects the syntactic structure of the target language, and *structural calque*, which introduces a new construction into the language (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 32). *Literal translation* is 'word-for-word' translation and preferable for the languages which share common cultural and linguistic features (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 33-35). *Transposition* "involves replacing one-word class with another without changing the meaning of the message" (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 36). *Obligatory transposition* and *optional transposition* are the types of transposition. The first one refers to the situation in which there is no choice between the two forms. However, *optional transposition* enables the translator to make a preference among several uses of language (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 36). *Modulation* is "a variation of the form of the message, obtained by a change in the point of view" (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 36). *Fixed modulation* and *free modulation* are the two types of modulation. *Fixed modulation*, "is the strategy in which the translator uses his good command of knowledge freely" and *free* modulation "is the single instances not yet fixed and sanctioned by usage" (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 37). *Equivalence* is the

description of the same situation in a target text through different stylistic and structural facilities (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 38). *Adaptation* is used when the type of situation in the source language is unknown and new to the target culture. In this respect, translators are responsible for creating a new situation that can be considered as being equivalent (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 39).

Delabastita (1993) lists five translation strategies: *substitution, repetition, deletion, addition and permutation*. *Substitution* involves replacing a source text item with an almost equivalent target code (Delabastita, 1993: 33-34). *Repetition* is transferring the source text item directly into target text (Delabastita, 1993: 34-35). In the strategy of *deletion*, the source text item is not transferred into into target text at all (Delabastita, 1993: 35-36). As for the *addition*, the source text item is transferred into target text with an extra cultural, linguistic or textual component which does not present in the source text (Delabastita, 1993: 36). In the last strategy, *permutation*, the translator compensates the source text item either with footnotes (*compensation by footnoting*) or with expressions that are expanded into a long stretch of text in the translation (Delabastita, 1993: 36-37).

Wallmach (2006: 18) indicates that "it is possible to fully describe feminist translation strategies using categories from Delabastita (1993) and Vinay and Darbelnet (1995)". When all the feminist translation strategies are compared, the following comprehensive table emerges and this holistic form of the strategies are utilized to analyze the target text in this study.

Table 1: Translation strategies

Delabastita	Vinay & Darbalnet	von Flotow
Substitution	Literal translation Transposition Modulation Adaptation Equivalence	
Repetition	Borrowing Calque	
Deletion		
Addition		
Permutation a. Compensation by footnoting b. Compensation by splitting		Supplementing Prefacing and footnoting Hijacking

2. Method

In this section, firstly, the purpose of the research will be mentioned and the research questions will be determined in line with the identified objectives. In the following subheadings, the research method, data collection and data analysis tools will be identified.

2.1. Purpose of the research

This study aims to analyze the short story *Mothers* by Sylvia Plath and evaluate the translation of feminist discourse in Turkish based on feminist translation and descriptive translation theories. Besides, through this study, it is striven for embodying the translation process by including the translator's views and experiences as a woman.

2.2.Research questions

Aiming at conducting a comparative analysis, this study seeks answers to the following research questions:

1. How the notions of motherhood, womanhood and sorority presented in the original text?
2. Does the translator make any preparations regarding the text before the translation process? And what reception does the translator as a woman show in the translation process?
3. Is the target text an "acceptable" or "adequate" translation regarding "initial norms", "preliminary norms" and "operational norms"?
4. What translation strategies does the author apply while translating the notions of motherhood, womanhood and sorority regarding feminist translation studies? Are they efficacious in describing the translation decisions?

2.3. Research method

Since the aim of the study is to examine how the feminist discourse is produced in the target text and culture to reveal the translator's thoughts on the translation process with a descriptive approach, the research method was determined as a case study.

2.4. Data collection

In accordance with the purpose of the study and research method, data collection tools were determined as document review and interviews. In this context, the documents to be examined have been determined as the source and target text. The

source text analyzed is Sylvia Plath's short story titled *Mothers* (1962) in English and *Anneler* (2015), which was translated into Turkish by Olcay Boynudelik. Moreover, in line with the purpose of this study, translator Olcay Boynudelik was contacted by e-mail to clarify the translation process and to examine her experiences regarding the translation. The research has been approved with the decision numbered 03/19 taken by Trakya University Social And Humanities Research Ethics Committee on 24 March 2021.

2.5. Data analysis

Before making a comparative analysis of the source and target texts, the source text is examined in terms of feminist discourse referencing motherhood, womanhood and sorority. Upon identifying the contexts concerning these notions, a comparative analysis is made by evaluating their translation into Turkish through the translation strategies suggested by von Flotow. Besides, considering the norms posited by Toury, it is identified whether the translation is "acceptable" or "adequate".

3. Findings

3.1. The author and source text

Sylvia Plath was born on 27 October 1932 in the Massachusetts Memorial Hospital in the USA as the child of Aurelia Frances Schober and Otto Emil Plath (Steinberg, 2004: 9). Eight years later, she lost his father (ibid: 13). This loss is reflected in her poems and stories from time to time. Especially in the poem titled *Daddy*, which is included in the book *The Colossus and Other Poems* (Plath, 1960), it is possible to see the traces of the destruction caused by his father's death. Plath, who published his first poem in the Boston Herald at the age of eight and a half, gave the impression of a healthy and social child, but he grows up with fluctuations in her spiritual world (Wagner-Martin, 2003: 11).

Having a thriving student life, Plath was accepted as a scholarship student to Smith College in 1950, which gave her academic, social and artistic skills (Bassnett, 2005: 7). Plath spent time as a student in the summer of 1953 in New York, working as guest editor for Mademoiselle Magazine. Soon, she tried to commit suicide by taking sleeping pills and was hospitalized in a mental hospital and recovered after treatment (Steinberg: 2004: 37-40). The psychological fluctuations she suffered, depression and the healing process she experienced turned into fiction for the only novel she wrote *Bell Jar* in 1963 (Steinberg, 2004: 94). Plath returned to Smith College after her treatment and completed her education. With the Fulbright scholarship she earned, she went to Cambridge University and met the poet Ted Hughes. The couple married in 1956 (Bassnett, 2005: 9-12; Steinberg, 2004: 50-52). She returned to America with an offer from Smith College in 1957-1958 and began to teach at school where she was once a student (Bassnett, 2005: 14-15). In 1960, she

returned to England and gave birth to her daughter Frieda and two years later his son Nicholas (Bassnett, 2005: 15; Steinberg, 2004: 84). In 1962, her husband left her for another woman. Plath moved to a separate house with her children, and that winter, she created her work named *Ariel*, which includes her most well-known poems (Bassnett, 2005: 16-17). She attempted suicide for the first time in the same year and was hospitalized for psychiatric treatment. However, in 1963, she committed suicide by putting her head in gas ovens. (Steinberg, 2004: 113-119).

The short story titled *Mothers*, written by Plath in 1962, was published after her death in the October issue of the American women's magazine *McCall's* in 1972. The story published with Plath's other short stories in the book *Johnny Panic and the Bibles of Dreams* in 1977 by Faber and Faber Limited. In the introduction of the book by Ted Hughes, the influence of Plath's personality and his experiences with his illness on his authorship is discussed.

Mothers is about the Mothers' Union in Devon, in which Esther and her family (her husband and daughter) have recently moved from America. Esther, also pregnant with the second child, is an American and she wants to be a part of society and to be accepted in Devon. To achieve this, she must be a member of the Mothers' Union which is run by the rector – a male figure who has the authority over the Mother's Union. Mariana Chaves Petersen (2019) has examined the short story titled *Mothers* in detail and revealed the similarities between Plath's life and Esther.

3.2. The translator and target text

The translator, Olcay Boynudelik graduated from Istanbul University - English Language and Literature Department. Currently, she is lecturing at Yeditepe University. To comprehend her translation process, she provided information through e-mail and remarked:

> "I was 22 years old when I was offered to translate Plath and my translation experience was very limited. So I turned down the offer, saying "How would I dare?" But, the publishers (it was the first edition by Altıkırkbeş, not Kırmızı Kedi) who knew me well convinced me that there could be no translator who could understand the spirit of Sylvia better than me.
>
> When I think of Sylvia Plath, the first definition that comes to my mind is "restless soul". I can say the same about myself. Therefore, the translation process was even more painful. In other words, both the anxiety of being able to translate her words correctly into my own language and seeing the reflections of her similar internal conflicts were very backbreaking. I cannot say that I am proud of the translation. I guess I wouldn't say 'yes' to *Johnny Panic and Bible of Dreams* if the same offer came today. Naturally, young people are bold" (O. Boynudelik, personal communication, February 22, 2021).

As for the target text, the first chapter of *Johnny Panik ve Rüyaların Kutsal Kitabı* was published by Altıkırkbeş in 2000. In 2015, Kırmızı Kedi published the complete word with the same title and in this edition is utilized.

3.3. Comparative Analysis of the Source and Target Texts

Before realizing a comparative analysis of the source and target texts, the target text is evaluated regarding the target-oriented approach suggested by Toury to identify the position of the target text in the context of target language's and culture's norm.

The first level of the target-oriented approach is initial norms, in which the translator decides on the extreme orientations: *adequacy* or *acceptability*. Considering the translation, it is obvious that the use of the expressions specific to the source culture prevails in translation. The translator partly prefers transferring them as they are, sometimes through footnotes and sometimes through the equivalences in the target culture. In this context, it can be concluded that the translator balances between source and the target culture; hence between the poles of *adequacy* and *acceptability*. This tendency may give rise to the thought that the translator aims to implicate being visible in her translation.

As for the *preliminary norms*; *translation policy* and *directness of the translation* should be dealt with. *Translation policy* covers the decisions taken by the translator as to which author and which text will be translated. When the translations made by the translator until today are examined, it is seen that she has translated works of children's literature and historical novels as well as feminist works. It is estimated that the aim of the translator in translating Plath may be to bring the feminist discourse into the Turkish literature and culture system. *Directness of translation* is related to which language the translation is made from. These are the norms as to whether the translation is made directly from the original or pivot language. The work in question was translated from the original language.

Regarding *operational norms*, the completeness of the text and linguistic preferences of the translator are identified. To begin with the *metrical norms*, the translator does not relocate any part of the text. Yet, she did not transfer the *Introduction* part of the book completely, instead, she presented overall thoughts of Ted Hughes on Plath's authorship. In fact, in this part, Hughes mentions Plath's weaknesses and her inability to become a good writer due to her obsession with the truth. According to him, Plath could have been a much better writer who had given up this obsession. He posits that she wrote much better when she was not afraid to publish her stories and whatever she wrote in general and examples of this could be seen in her diaries. Hughes describes this situation as if it was Plath's failure to fulfillment; something an author should never do. On the other hand, Plath, in her works, illustrated how the outside world - which is actually a male one - has impeded her. These are the thoughts of Ted Hughes on Plath's authorship, yet, the translator omitted some part of it. By doing so, she censored the *Introduction* part to some extent.

In terms of cultural notions, the translator uses three footnotes to explain some cultural notions such as *scullery*, *lych-gate* and *Unitarian*. By doing so, the translator indicates that she is visible in the target text. With the terms of Delabastita, she makes use of the strategy *compensation by footnoting* and von Flotow's *footnoting*. In terms of *textual-linguistic norms*, the linguistic material including lexical items, phrases and stylistic features are analyzed utilizing the translation strategies propounded by von Flotow. The analysis of linguistic material is rendered through thematized concepts such as motherhood/womanhood, social belonging, sorority and patriarchy.

Table 2: Motherhood and Womanhood

ST	TT
1. Esther tugged her red turban down around her ears, then adjusted the folds of her cashmere coat loosely **so that she might, to the casual eye, seem simply tall, stately and fat, rather than eight months pregnant.**	Esther kırmızı eşarbını kulaklarının hizasına indirdi, ardından **dikkatsiz gözlere**, **sekiz aylık hamile gibi değil, uzun boylu, heybetli ve** şişman **görünebilmek için** kaşmir paltosunun önünü gevşekçe bağladı (p. 120).
2. Esther felt **her little grievances about Tom's not shaving and his letting the baby in the dirt fade** at the sight of the two often, quiet and in the perfect accord.	Esther'in, **Tom'un tıraş olmayışı ve bebeğin pislik içinde oynamasına izin vermesi yüzünden hissettiği küçük rahatsızlık**, onların ikisinin mükemmel bir ahenk içindeki sessiz görüntüsü karşısında kaybolup gidecekti. (p. 121)

In Table 2, two discourses convey the duties of mothers and women: falling pregnant, taking care of children and manage the house. In the first example, the translator prefers using the strategies of *literal translation* and *obligatory transposition* "replacing one word class with another without changing the meaning of the message" (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 33-36) and *substitution* (Delabastita, 1993: 33-34). However, she translates the phrase **'the casual eye'** as **'dikkatsiz gözlere'** [to inattentive eyes] considering the strategy of *equivalence*, creating a new usage in target text. Secondly, the phrase **'rather than eight months pregnant'** [sekiz aylık hamileden ziyade][2] as **'sekiz aylık hamile gibi değil'** [not like eight months pregnant]. In this context, the translator shows the tendency of using *free modulation* strategy, which is a variation of the form of the message, obtained by a change in the point of view.

In the second example, the translator directly transfers the message into the target language without interference. As the translation is rendered through using the strategies of *literal translation* and *obligatory transposition* (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 33-36) and *substitution* (Delabastita, 1993: 33-34) as the translator conveys the source text's message without changing the meaning.

Table 3: Social Belonging

ST	TT
1. If Mrs. Nolan, an Englishwoman by her looks and accent, and a pub-keeper's wife as well, **felt herself a stranger in Devon after six years, what hope has Esther, an American, of infiltrating that rooted society ever at all?**	Görünüşü ve aksanıyla bir İngiliz, aynı zamanda bir pub işletmecisinin eşi olan **Bayan Nolan altı yıl aradan sonra kendini Devon'da bir yabancı gibi hissediyorsa, Esther'in, bir Amerikalının, o köklü topluma sızma umudu hiç olabilir mi?** (p. 122)
2. A month later, still perturbed by the evangelical bells, Esther dashed off, half in spite of herself, a note to the rector. **She would like to attend Evensong. Would he mind explaining the ritual to her?**	Bir ay sonra hala Protestan çanlardan zihni karışık bir halde, kendisini durdurmaya çalıştıysa da papaza bir not karalamadan edemedi. **Akşam duasına katılmak istiyordu, töreni kendisine açıklaması mümkün müydü?** (p. 124).
3. Esther felt the baby throw and kick, and placidly thought: **I am a mother; I belong here.**	Esther bebeğin kıpırdayıp tekme attığını hissetti, yumuşak başlılıkla düşündü: **Ben bir anneyim; buraya aitim** (p. 125).
4. **"I didn't know they didn't allow divorcees**", Esther said. "Oh, no, they don't like 'em."	**"Boşanmış kişileri kabul etmediklerini bilmiyordum," dedi** Esther. "Ah, hayır, onlardan hoşlanmazlar." (p. 131)

Table 3 illustrates the discourses of social belonging, in other words, being a part/member of a group in society. When examined the table, it is understood that in all the examples the translator transfers the message into target language practicing strategies of both *literal translation* and *obligatory transposition* (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 33-36) and *substitution* (Delabastita, 1993: 33-34). However, in the second example, the translator translates "Evensong" as "akşam duası", which is the cultural equivalent in the target language. In this respect, in addition to *transposition* strategy, the translator maintains the strategy of *equivalence* (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 38). Besides, the word **'divorcees'**[3] is translated as **'boşanmış kişiler'** [people who got divorced]. In the source text, **'divorcees'** refer to women who got divorced, however, the translator prefers transferring the meaning without identifying gender. Although this can be a rare or unfavorable strategy in feminist translation practices, it can be coined as *obscuring* as she practices the opposite of *hijacking* strategy (von Flotow, 1991: 78-80), in which the translator feminizes the text deliberately.

Table 4: Sorority

ST	TT
1. This was Mrs. Nolan, the wife of the pub-keeper at the White Hart. Mrs. Nolan, Rose said, never came to the Mother's Union meetings **because she had no one to go with, so Rose was bringing her to this month's meeting, together with Ester.**	Bu, White Hart'taki pub işletmecisinin karısı Bayan Nolan'dı. Rose, **birlikte gidecek kimsesi olmadığı için** Bayan Nolan'ın Anneler Birliği toplantılarına hiç gelmediğini söyledi, **bu yüzden Rose onu Esther'le birlikte bu ayki toplantıya götürüyordu** (p. 120).
2. **Then Rose crooked out her two elbows, and Mrs. Nolan took one, and Esther took the other,** and the three women teetered in their best shoes down the stony lane past Rose's cottage, and the cottage of the old blind man his spinster sister at the bottom, and into the road.	**Sonra Rose iki dirseğini askılık gibi kaldırdı, birine Bayan Nolan, diğerine de Esther girdi**, üç kadın taşlı yoldan aşağı Rose'un evini, yaşlı kör adamın ve kız kurusu kız kardeşinin en aşağıdaki evini geçip yola doğru en iyi ayakkabılarıyla sallana sallana yürüdüler (p. 121)

In table 4, the discourses of sorority delineate unity among women. Throughout the narration, the translator carries the meaning of source text into target text making use of the strategies of *literal translation* and *obligatory transposition* (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 36) and *substitution* (Delabastita, 1993: 33-34) as she transfers it without any interference.

Table 5: Patriarchy

ST	TT
1. At last three women, two quite young and attractive, one very old, **came forward and knelt at the altar to be received into the Mothers' Union. (…) Four o'clock had struck before the rector allowed the women to depart.**	Sonunda, ikisi oldukça genç ve çekici, biri oldukça yaşlı üç kadın ilerleyip **Anneler Birliği'ne kabul edilmek için sunakta diz** çöktüler**. (…) Papaz kadınların ayrılmasına izin vermeden** önce **saat dördü vurmuştu** (p. 126).
2. Mrs. Nolan turned to Esther. "What do you do here?" It was the question of a desperate woman. "**Oh, I have the baby." Then Esther was ashamed of her evasion. "I type some of my husband's work."**	Bayan Nolan, Esther'e döndü: "Burada ne *yapıyorsun*?" Çaresiz bir kadının sorusuydu bu. **"**Şey**, bebeğim var." Kendi baştan savma cevabından Esther de utanmıştı. "Kocamın bazı işlerini daktiloya** çekiyorum**."** (p. 127)

3. "I'm sorry, **but the reason I've not called is because I thought you were a divorcee.** I usually make it a point not to bother them."	"Üzgünüm, ama **sizi** çağırmamamın **nedeni boşanmış olduğunuzu düşünmem.** Genellikle rahatsızlık vermek istemeyişimdeki asıl nokta budur." (pp. 130-131)
4. Rose glanced up as her two charges started to button their coats. "I'll go with you. **Cecil will want his tea.**	Yanındaki iki kişi paltolarını iliklemeye başlayınca, Rose başını onlara çevirdi. "Sizinle geliyorum, **Cecil** çayını **ister."** (p. 131)

The last table indicates the discourses of patriarchy, which means being controlled by men. The translator principally utilizes the strategies of *literal translation* and *obligatory transposition* (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1995: 33-36) and *substitution* (Delabastita, 1993: 33-34) as she transfers it without any interference.

Conclusion

In this study, the short story *Mothers* by Sylvia Plath and its Turkish translation *Anneler* by Olcay Boynudelik was compared based on Toury's target-oriented approach and feminist translation strategies of von Flotow, Vinay & Darbelnet and Delabastita in the scope of women issues. Before the analysis, some thoughts of key figures of feminist translation were mentioned; target-oriented approach and feminist translation strategies are presented to draw a frame for the theoretical background of the study. In *Method*, the aim of the study, research questions, research method, data collection and analysis were designated. In 12 contexts, feminist discourse with women issues, including motherhood/womanhood, social belonging, sorority and patriarchy, was determined.

Regarding the first research question, the notions of motherhood/womanhood, social belonging, sorority and patriarchy were presented through the oppression of women. Esther is pregnant, yet, she does not want to seem pregnant. She is responsible for the management of the house and keeps an eye on her husband and child. In terms of social belonging, it can be deduced that if a woman is an outsider or a divorcee, it is troublesome to be accepted by the community. In the narration, Esther is an outsider and Mrs. Nolan is a divorcee. The natives do not set them apart the Mothers' Union, but, they implicate through behaviors and tacit use of language. The sorority is portrayed through the support of Rose, who tries to include them among the Mothers' Union. The last notion, patriarchy is presented through the rector of the town in the context of church and the Mothers' Union. He is the authority and the decision- maker of the union. There are some other examples of

patriarchy as in the dialogue between Mrs. Nolan and Esther. Mrs. Nolan asks Esther the things she does in Devon and she replies that she types some of her husband's work, implying there is nothing she does for herself. Another and the last example is related to Rose and her husband Cecil, who wants his tea ready. Considering this example, Rose, who is an accepted member of the Mothers' Union, has the duty of serving tea to her husband.

The second research question is related to the translator and her translation process. Considering her reply, it is apparent that she did not accept translating Plath's work due to limited translation experience at that time. Yet, later on, she had to accept the offer. Regarding the translation process, the translator remarks that as a woman, she established empathy with Plath because of having similar internal conflicts

As for the third research question which deals with Toury's terms *adequacy* / *acceptability*, it can be inferred that the translation is both *acceptable* and *adequate*. Considering the initial norms, the translator translates the culture-specific items through the equivalences in the target culture and sometimes transfers them as they are without suggesting an equivalence. In line with the preliminary norms, the translator may aim to bring the feminist discourse into the Turkish literature, culture system and to take effect, she translates from the original text. For *operational norms*, it is seen that the translator omitted some part of the *Introduction* written by Hughes, avoiding translating his unfavorable thoughts about Plath. Taking into account all these finds, the translator balances between source and the target culture deciding on what to translate and how to translate and balancing between the poles of *adequacy* and *acceptability*.

The last research question is related to the feminist translation strategies that the translator practicing while translating the woman issues covering motherhood/ womanhood, social belonging, sorority and patriarchy. In general, she prefers *literal translation* and *transposition* strategies in line with *equivalence* and *modulation*. However, while translating the word *divorcee*, the aforementioned strategies are not efficacious, therefore, a new translation strategy coined obscuring is suggested.

Within the scope of this study, how feminist discourse is transferred to another language and culture is examined through feminist translation strategies and other translation strategies. During the analysis, the opinions of the female translator regarding the translation process were also included. Consequently, it was realized that the translator used various strategies while translating the feminist discourse into Turkish. In addition to this, the importance of including the translator's thoughts in translation studies was recognized. Besides, a new translation strategy was proposed in addition to the translation strategies used. Concordantly, it can be understood that feminist translation studies are open to suggestions and frequently benefit from translation studies as in other interdisciplinary fields.

Endnotes

1. For the Turkish translation of the term see Öztürk Kasar, S. & Tuna, D. (2017). Sosyal bilimler alanında terimcelerin çevrilmesi ve türkçe terim üretimi. *Turkish Studies International Periodical for the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic*, *12*(13), 415-436. http://dx.doi.org/10.7827/TurkishStudies.12027
2. The translations in square brackets belong to the researcher.
3. Considering Plath wrote it in American English, for the definition of *divorcee* see https://dictionary.cambridge.org/tr/s%C3%B6zl%C3%BCk/ingilizce/divorcee

References

Bassnett, S. (2005). *Sylvia Plath - An introduction to the poetry*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Blank, H. (2008). *Bekâretin "El değmemiş" tarihi* (E. Ergün, Trans) İletişim.

Bozkurt, S. (2014). Touched translations in Turkey: A feminist translation approach. *Moment Journal*, *1*(1), 104–124. https://doi.org/10.17572/mj2014.1.104124

Castro, O., and Ergün, E. (2017). *Feminist translation studies: Local and transnational perspectives*. Routledge.

Castro, O., Ergün. E., von Flotow. L., Spoturno, M. L. (2020). Towards transnational feminist translation studies. *Mutatis Mutandis. Revista Latinoamericana de Traducción,* 13(1), 2-10. doi: 10.27533/udea.mut.v13n1a01

Chaves Petersen, M. (2019). Female relationships, motherhood, and loss of language in *The Bell Jar* and "Mothers". *Plath Profiles*, (11), 1, 57-74.

Delabastita, D. (1993). *There's a double tongue: An Investigation into the Translation of Shakespeare's Wordplay, with Special Reference to Hamlet*. Rodopi.

Ergün, E. (2017). Translational beginnings and origin/izing stories: (Re)writing the history of the contemporary feminist movement in Turkey (In L. von Flotow, & F. Farahzad, Ed.) *Translating women: Different voices and new horizons*, Routledge, 41-55.

Ergün, E. (2013). Reconfiguring translation as intellectual activism: The Turkish feminist remaking of virgin: The untouched history. *Trans-Scripts*, 3, 264-289.

Ergün, E. (2010a). Bridging across feminist translation and sociolinguistics. *Language and Linguistics Compass*, *4*(5), 307–318. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-818X.2010.00208.x

Ergün, E. (2010b). *Dismantling virginity: Social, medical, and legal control of female sexuality in* Turkey. LAP.

Godard, B. (1989). Theorizing feminist discourse/translation. Tessera, 6, 42-53. https://tessera.journals.yorku.ca/index.php/tessera/article/view/23583

Irigaray, L. (1985). *This sex which is not one* (C. Porter, Trans.) Cornell University.

Kuleli, M. (2019). Marxist feminist discourse in a Turkish novel with Eugene Nida's concept of "equivalence" applied on translation evaluation of the novel. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*, (16), 703-720. https://doi.org/10.29000/ rumelide.621178

Plath, S. (2015). Anneler. *Johnny Panic ve Rüyaların Kutsal Kitabı* (O. Boynudelik, Çev.) Kırmızı Kedi.

Plath, S. (1963). *Bell jar*. Heinemann.

Plath, S. (1960). *The colossus and other poems*. Heinemann.

Saki Demirel, A. and Tarakcıoğlu, A. Ö. (2019). Feminist translation practices in Turkey: The case of the feminist websites 5Harfliler and çatlak zemin. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*, (15), 295-312. https://doi.org/10.29000/rumelide.580614

Simon, S. (1996). *Gender in translation: Cultural identity and the politics of transmission*. Routledge.

Steinberg, P. K. (2004). *Great writers Sylvia Plath.* Chelsea House.

Toury, G. (1995). *Descriptive translation studies and beyond*. John Benjamins.

Wagner-Martin, L. (2003). *Sylvia Plath a literary life*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Wallmach, K. (2006) Feminist translation strategies: Different or derived?, *Journal of Literary Studies*, *(22)*1-2, 1-26. https://doi.org/10.1080/02564710608530388

Vinay, J.P. and Darbelnet, J. (1995) *Comparative stylistics of French and English* (Translated and edited by J.C. Sager & M-J. Hamel) John Benjamins.

von Flotow, L. (1997). *Translation and gender: Translating in the 'era of feminism'*. St Jerome.

von Flotow, L. (1991). Feminist translation: Contexts, practices and theories. *TTR: Traduction, Terminologie, Rédaction*, 4(2), 69-84. https://doi.org/10.7202/037094ar

Electronic resources

Plath, S. (2016). Mothers. *Johnny Panic and the Bible of Dreams*. Harperperennial. 05.01.2021.https://www.amazon.com/Johnny-Panic-Bible-Dreams-Sylviaebook/dp/B01KT1845W

Bu eser Creative Commons Atıf 4.0 Uluslararası Lisansı ile lisanslanmıştır. (This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License).